
Evaluation of Regional Owned Enterprise Management Policy; Case Study PT. Pelabuhan Kepri, Indonesia

Raja Suhaila^{*}, Adji Suradji Muhammad, Rudi Subiyakto

Postgraduate Public Administration Department, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Universitas Maritim Raja Ali Haji, Tanjungpinang City, Indonesia

Email address:

ellahamzah@gmail.com (R. Suhaila), suradji@umrah.ac.id (A. S. Muhammad), rudisubiyaktodap2015@gmail.com (R. Subiyakto)

^{*}Corresponding author

To cite this article:

Raja Suhaila, Adji Suradji Muhammad, Rudi Subiyakto. Evaluation of Regional Owned Enterprise Management Policy; Case Study PT. Pelabuhan Kepri, Indonesia. *Journal of Public Policy and Administration*. Vol. 5, No. 4, 2021, pp. 144-150. doi: 10.11648/j.jppa.20210504.14

Received: November 3, 2021; **Accepted:** November 19, 2021; **Published:** November 27, 2021

Abstract: Regional-Owned Enterprises, abbreviated as BUMD is government instrument that plays an important role in running and developing regional and national economies. BUMD, the capital, comes from separated regional assets to contribute to the region and carry out regional development through services to the community. PT. Pelabuhan Kepri is a subsidiary BUMD of the Kepulauan Riau (Kepri) Province, which has strategic main tasks and functions in managing the potential or water activities in border areas with neighboring countries to improve the business properly. The purpose of this study is to analyze the evaluation of the management policies of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri as a form of boosting the Kepri economy. The qualitative research method is carried out using a literature study approach that uses existing secondary data, including reports, journals, e-books, websites, and others considered relevant for depth analysis. The results show that it is necessary to strengthen the regional regulation plan (RAPENDA) regarding optimization in management, which must be discussed with stakeholders as a form of policy evaluation in preparing the management of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri in a sustainable manner for the long term. However, it should be emphasized the implementation of RAPENDA is only to improve the quality and quantity of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri in implementing programs that have great potential in the waters of the Kepri Province in the future, so the local own-source revenue can be by the targets to be achieved.

Keywords: Policy Evaluation, BUMD, PT Pelabuhan Kepri, Indonesia

1. Introduction

In the era of regional autonomy, the government has provided broad opportunities for local governments to improve the welfare of their people. Local governments can regulate several aspects of life in their areas, including economic, educational, health, social, and cultural [1]. From an economic perspective, local governments have the authority to form a Regional Owned Enterprise or abbreviated as BUMD, from the provincial, regency, sub-district to village levels [2]. The concept of managing non-Persero BUMD (Regional Companies/Regional Public Companies) is possible with the BUMD management model with an independent self-management system [3]. This management concept used responsible and intensive supervision or guidance system. BUMD management is carried out with direct supervision and guidance by

stakeholders whose done by regional heads as the highest authority holders in regional governments [4].

The authority of the local government as the authority holder can carry out "policy intervention" in a positive context related to the performance of BUMD through the supervisory board. Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning the Regional Government states that in the management of BUMD, one must contain elements of good corporate governance [5, 6]. However, government regulations and the others that further regulate provisions regarding good corporate governance in the management of BUMD have not been issued [7]. Meanwhile, the concept of managing BUMD Persero (Limited Company/Regional Company), based on Permendagri Number 3 of 1998 concerning BUMD Legal Entities, states that BUMD is formed a limited obligation company is subject to Law Number 40 of 2007 concerning Limited Liability Companies and the implementing

regulations [8].

Based on previous research that focused on the management of BUMD, the lack of large capital in port development, Kepri Province Government will build it gradually, and the priority scale for the management will be submitted to the Port BUMD, namely PT. Pelabuhan Kepri. [9]. Then, there is a delay in the implementation of the cooperation agreement for capital participation in this case investment due to an error or negligence in the management of the organization so that a policy evaluation in the management of BUMD needs to be carried out. [10, 11] In addition, They can carry out a restructuring of BUMD management by conducting an inventory related to the grouping of forms, types, and characteristics of BUMD [12]. The large number and characteristics of BUMD in each region cause the management of BUMD not to focus and achieve Good Corporate Governance. Several adjustments are needed, including constructing the form and legal status of the BUMD itself, human resources, and management [13].

Kepri Province currently has a BUMD that can increase local revenue (PAD), namely PT. Pelabuhan Kepri. The establishment is based on the Kepri Province Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2013. On April 25, 2013, concerning the Establishment of the Port Business Entity of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri. Notary Deed of MUSLIM, SH Number 39 on November 29, 2013, and the Decree of the Minister of Law and Human Rights Number AHU-04958. AH.01.01 of 2014 concerning the Legalization of the Company's Legal Entity dated February 6, 2014. The purpose of establishing PT. Pelabuhan Kepri is under the auspices of the Kepri BUMD. The implicit goal of managing the utilization of the port and sea area is to regulate the use of space so that it can provide the maximum benefit to improve people's welfare.

Furthermore, there is legal certainty for stakeholders and for local governments, both city/district and provincial governments, in exploring and managing resources for the welfare of the community; creating job opportunities for people who have the skills and competencies; providing economical and social benefits for the community as well as increase local revenue and carry out business activities in the field of ports and use of marine space that are not in conflict with the laws and regulations.

Moreover, PT. Pelabuhan Kepri still has experienced problems as that has not been maximized. The problems encountered by researchers are PT. Pelabuhan Kepri, by Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2013, is a Limited Company (PT) that is engaged in the port business. This makes PT. Pelabuhan Kepri is in a dilemma because at the beginning of the formation, PT. Pelabuhan Kepri is not provided with facilities or asset delegation from the Kepri Government in port facilities as a spearhead for business development. The next problem is the support from the local government has not been maximized. Constructors and supervisors play an important role in the performance process for developing port business entities both from an administrative and technical perspective. In addition, PT. Pelabuhan Kepri has not yet received the necessary permits

for business activities. The activities that want to be developed are hampered, and this is because the completeness of the licensing process, both technical and administrative, still takes a long time and cannot be obtained in a short time.

This research aims to evaluate policies on the management of BUMD in a case study at PT. Pelabuhan Kepri. So, it is necessary to evaluate policies in the management of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri to implement the work program so that there are no major obstacles. The concept of policy evaluation has a definition that includes activities involving the estimation or assessment of policies that include substance, implementation, and impact [14]. Policy evaluation is "an objective, systematic, empirical of the impact of ongoing policies and public programs on targets in terms of achieving the goals they want to achieve [15]. Evaluation can also contribute to the definition of a new policy alternative or a revised policy by showing that the previously necessary to be removed and replaced with another. Evaluation of public policy has four functions, as follows:

Explanation: through evaluation, the reality of program implementation can be made and can be generalizations about the patterns of relationships between the various dimensions of reality that are observed. From this evaluation, the evaluator can identify problems, conditions, and actors that support the success or failure of the policy.

Obedience: Through evaluation, They can see whether the actions taken by the actors, both the bureaucracy and other actors, are based on the standards and procedures set by the policy.

Audits: Through thorough evaluation, it can be known whether the outputs reach the target group of policies or whether there are leaks or deviations.

Accounting: The evaluation can be known, and they can know the socio-economic consequences of the policy [16].

Evaluation plays several key functions in policy analysis. Evaluation is an important stage in the implementation of a program. That will obtain positive benefits if the evaluation is carried out properly and considers all aspects of a program [17]. In policy evaluation, it is also emphasized that it does not always big result [18]. While the concept of evaluation suggests 'implicit feedback' is an inherent part of the policy cycle, it may not be operational in many case studies or may result in only additional changes to the existence of the policy evaluation [19].

2. Research Method

Researchers choose qualitative methods with more emphasis on observing the phenomenon and more research into the substance of the meaning of the phenomenon [20]. The analysis and sharpness of qualitative research are strongly influenced by the strength of words and sentences used to strengthen the process and the meaning of the results [21]. Furthermore, data analysis is used to use secondary data. Secondary data is part of the literature study by strengthening

the case studies studied where the sources of research data are obtained and collected by researchers indirectly. Still, the existing literature includes documents, ebooks, journals, websites, and other sources that are considered relevant for in-depth analysis [22, 23]. The analysis is carried out using the concept of policy evaluation where the activities of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri, which BUMD manages, can provide analysis related to the existing problems. Strengthening in the policy evaluation analysis using triangulation techniques on relevant sources to facilitate researchers in determining the object of research [24].

3. Result and Discussion

Kepri Province Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2013 concerning the Establishment of a Port Business Entity, PT. Pelabuhan Kepri, the Kepri Province Government, has formed an agency to carry out port and port services business by utilizing land and sea waters in Kepri. These efforts are formed of core port business and port services, shipping, transportation management, multi- and intermodal transportation operators, stock portfolio, and all other services related to the sustainable transportation sector and the derivative businesses. While the purpose of the establishment of the Port Business Entity is,

Managing and utilizing the Kepri waters, including the natural and geographical potential of the region and developing the port and port industry related to the sea and other intermodal transportation:

Creating job opportunities, opening up derivative business opportunities, overcoming unemployment and poverty problems;

Mastering modern technology, both information technology, communication, telecommunications, and other special software such as VTIS (Vessel Tracking Information System) and the other according to the needs of the port and port service business sector, as well as applying modern, advanced and open management principles:

Mastering data and information as a port and port service provider through the provision of infrastructure, including navigation and sea traffic management;

Improving the community's welfare by managing regional potential, especially sea transportation and other more efficient modes, contribute to the community/regional economy and increases regional income, either directly or indirectly.

The Port Business Entity named PT. Pelabuhan Kepri faced obstacles that they must face. External constraints because the Ministry of Transportation of the Republic of Indonesia or in the area called the Port Authority, which is the government's representative in all sea waters in the territory of the Republic of Indonesia, will regulate all Shipping on water transportation, ports, shipping safety and security, and the national transportation system, where the before Law 17 of 2008 concerning Shipping as of that all ports and port activities throughout Indonesia were carried out by PT. Port Indonesia, where a Port Business Entity will manage the location of the

port named PT. Pelabuhan Kepri must find a port outside of PT. Port Indonesia, which has been managing ports in the Kepri Province as the manager of port assets that have been built by the Ministry of Transportation of the Republic of Indonesia, is currently developing in the Kepri Province, even tend to be without port development (can be seen in Batam, Tanjung Pinang, Karimun, Anambas, Natuna, Lingga, Bintan). This means that it can hinder connectivity and accessibility between islands in the Kepri Province, whose territory consists of 96% of the ocean and 4% is land consisting of 2,406 islands.

The provision of very large capital in the construction of a port and human resources who will manage the ports that will be managed by the Port Business Entity owned by the Kepri Province Government because it consists of many islands. In accordance with Law 17 of 2008 concerning Shipping Articles 90 to 94 regarding activities in ports and Port Business Entities and Law 23 of 2014 concerning regional government Article 27 which reads "The authority of the Province to manage natural resources at sea a maximum of 12 (twelve) nautical miles measured from the coastline towards the high seas or towards archipelagic waters", has set the boundaries of the management area for marine waters so that the Port Business Entity owned by the Kepri Province Government together with all regencies and cities in the Kepri Province can focus on doing business in the sea area because the maritime area of the Kepri Province is very wide (96%) and in a strategic area (bordering the Singapore and Malaysia regions), and in accordance with the Kepri Province spatial plan, the Port Business Entity can be the manager to their territory accordingly with the autonomy authority area where from the coast up to 12 miles is an area have given by the central government to regulate the territory.

3.1. Activities of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri Based on Regional Regulations

Based on regional regulation number 1 of 2021, April 9, 2021 (Kepri Province sheet of 2021 number 1, an additional Sheet of the Kepri Province number 53) regarding the participation of capital goods by regionally owned in BUMD that have permits, among those managed by PT. Pelabuhan Kepri including the operation of the MV. The Kepri route serves the following routes: Tanjungpinang - Benan - Mensanak - Rejai - Tanjung Kelit - Sungai Tenam - Palun - Jagoh - Daik (PP); At the beginning of 2018 after the independently managed of the Kepri MV ships had expired, the 3 month trial period in February 2018 PT. Pelabuhan Kepri again carried out operational cooperation with the shipping company to operate the Kepri MV ships, intending to continue to serve the people of Lingga Regency. Cooperation between PT. Pelabuhan Kepri and PT. Prima Buana Indah Number: UM.58/1/7PK-18 on February 21, 2018. PT. Pelabuhan Kepri has deposited into the regional revenue from the results of the operation of the ship on August 7, 2020, amounting to IDR. 3,441,399,325.

PT. Pelabuhan Kepri received approval for the marine

advisory service business from the Department of Transportation in Kepri Province, a memorandum of agreement for the cooperation of marine advisory/marine advisory service (not scout) in Kepri waters (Karimun – Natuna) with Pt. Indo Perdana Lioyd. The number of ships passing through has been served from September 2019 to March 2021, as many as 88 ships. PT. Pelabuhan Kepri has obtained permission to manage anchor areas in Riau Kabil Waters and Tanjung Berakit waters in Kepri Province. As many as four permits have been owned, including in 2020 the Decree of the Minister of Transportation of the Republic of Indonesia number KM 16 of 2020 concerning the determination of the certain location of areas in waters outside the work environment and environmental areas of port that function for anchoring activities in the waters of Kabil, Riau Strait, Kepri Province.

Furthermore, in 2020, the Decree of Minister of Transportation of the Republic of Indonesia number KM 30 of 2002 concerning the determination of the location of certain areas in waters outside the work environment and areas for ports that function for anchoring activities in the waters of Tanjung Berakit, Kepri Province. Moreover, through the Decree of the Governor of Kepri Number 1111 of 2020 regarding the appointment of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri is the manager of the anchorage area in the waters of Kabil Riau and Tanjung Berakit waters in the Kepri Province. That obtained the last permit in the Kepri Governor's decision number 446/1B.2/DPMPTSP/XI/2020 regarding the environmental permit for anchoring activities and transferring goods from ship to ship in the waters of Tanjung Berakit, Bintan Regency, Kepri Province by PT. Pelabuhan Kepri.

In addition, PT. Pelabuhan Kepri cooperates with the private sector to construct the Feeder Port in Batam City. This collaboration was marked by the signing of a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU). Currently, the provincial government continues to encourage the discussion of the Kepri Province RZWP3K to be completed quickly to make it easier to regulate coastal and small islands so that the allocation is clear for tourism, marine, fisheries, etc. In addition, with this regional issuance, economic improvement is easier. The Feeder Port, located in the Sadai village area, Batam, will temporarily function as a port that serves inter-island shipping throughout the Kepri Province. However, in the future, to target this port to become an international port that can serve to ship between Malaysia and Singapore.

3.2. Policy Evaluation on the Management of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri

The purpose of this evaluation is to carry out program evaluations to "determine the quality of the program by formulating an assessment [25]. There are two functions to consider the purpose of the evaluation. Formative evaluation provides information about product or process improvements. Summative evaluation provides information about the short-term effectiveness or long-term impact to decide the adoption of a product or process. Not all evaluations have the same goal. Some evaluations serve as a monitoring function,

only focusing on measurable program results or evaluation findings. The types of evaluations will be difficult to combine [26].

Evaluation is a systematic, rigorous, and accurate scientific method for assessing a program's design, implementation, improvement, or outcome. These are all part of a human resource-intensive process, often requiring human resources, such as evaluating expertise, labor, time, and a large enough budget [27]. Then, nowadays, many evaluation approaches used greatly contribute to solving important problems [17, 28]; the approach has been adapted from the findings, the improving used existing approach as follows:

Political Control: This approach is used to retain money and power or to gain and increase influence with a major power in a conflict that secures evidence of utility for the client. The error of this approach is violating the principles of full and honest disclosure [29]. In the case study PT. Pelabuhan Kepri does not have an element of political control, so it needs to be prepared for operational needs, which is the facilities have obstacles. This is due to the absence of an individual political approach so the strength in improving the management of PT. The Kepri Port is still a formality in carrying out the program by current regional regulations.

Public relations: The approach aims to broaden and generate a positive image among the public with the main power to secure the evidence that is most likely to strengthen public support. This approach's main weakness, on the other hand, is against various principles related to reporting, justification, and impartiality. [30] In addition, states in general public relations can be defined as a strategic communication process that builds mutually beneficial relationships between organizations and society [31]. PT. Pelabuhan Kepri does not have a strong influence on the social life community; only certain actors prioritize involving business and bureaucratic actors in implementing the management of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri by the duties and main functions of performance.

Experimental Research: causal relationships that determine causal relationships between variables which is the strongest paradigm for determining causal relationships, require controlled settings, limiting the variety of evidence, especially focusing on outcomes [32]. In the current cause and effect, it is important to the Kepri Province Government and the Kepri House of Representatives to oversee the programs that are currently being carried out and the programs that have been prepared in the future PT. Pelabuhan Kepri, so the strength of the causal relationship as a form of policy evaluation is mutually beneficial, suggestions, criticisms which constructive in the management of BUMD in Kepri Province, especially PT. Pelabuhan Kepri.

Management Information System (MIS): information systems used for decision making and the coordination, control, analysis, and visualization of information within an organization [33]. Management information systems study examines people, processes, and technology in an organizational context [34, 35]. The management information

system focuses more on using a managed system technically in carrying out the PT Pelabuhan Kepri program. For example, the Management Information System in services that are integrated with PT. Pelindo in sea transportation services where the management information system can regulate, implement and evaluate the general income results obtained by the two companies to increase local revenue that is transparent, accountable, and credible in conducting an audit by an independent agency.

Program Testing: the process of running a program to find errors made by an organizational leader to run program experiments in the field of performance carried out by the organizations and tested by a testing unit such as an independent supervisory [36]. At this time, in the programs that have been accomplished, many programs were implemented by PT. Pelabuhan Kepri had discrepancies in their implementation. The products of the rules and the implemented regulations did not reach the target due to lack of facility support, that is, technical operations, so the targeted income was not expected by local stakeholders.

Accountability is in ethics and governance that is a responsibility [37]. As an aspect of governance, the center of discussions related to issues in the public sector, non-profit and private contexts (companies), and individuals involved in leadership roles aimed at improving the quality of products and services [38]. Accountability at PT. Pelabuhan Kepri has not shown maximum results. As evidence of the many financial problems in managing the sea transportation service program, the funding issued is not proportional to the income. For example, there are still rampant goods transportation services found illegally at Sri Bintan Pura, Tanjungpinang City. The findings from the Kepri Customs Directorate for smuggling from foreign and domestic people returned the findings to the state treasury, which completely harmed the Kepri Province's original regional income.

Decision Orientation: is a base knowledge and values to make in defending decisions. This encourages the use of evaluation to plan and implement required programs. Then, help to justify decisions about plans and actions. The disadvantage it has to carry out the necessary collaboration between evaluators & decision-makers to provide opportunities for the expected results [39]. The orientation of the decision is more on the policies that have been produced. PT. Pelabuhan Kepri has been appointed through the Decree of the Governor of Kepri in the Anchor Harbor management program at several points which have been shown to have an impact on future local revenue in the territorial waters of the Kepri Province, means that the decision made by the Regional Head is very appropriate to fully surrender the rights and the authority given to PT Pelabuhan Kepri to regulate the course of the anchoring program. Policy Studies is a part of political science that includes the analysis of the policy-making process (policy process) and the content of policies that are deeply analyzed [40]. Policy studies include Research in substantive fields such as health or education policy, program evaluation and impact studies, and policy design [41]. The weakness of this evaluation is often

undermined or subverted by the politically charged actions of the evaluators, in the case of the evaluation management policy of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri did not contain any substantive elements, because of the sub BUMD of the Kepri Province, especially in PT. Pelabuhan Kepri is only a business entity that, in implementation, is under the local government's supervision, management, and guidance.

Consumer-Oriented; Evaluation is a process in which the assessment is focused not on the leader of a particular organization but around assessing a product, service, or public organization. The purpose is to provide information for users, customers, or consumers who may need a credible & competent evaluator [42]. At this time, the existing program at PT. Pelabuhan Kepri, in public services as a form of business planning, has carried out policy evaluations in implementing policies in the future. In this case, the evaluator is the regional government of the Kepri Province, also in a limited meeting with members of the House of Representatives in Kepri Province.

3.3. Preparation of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri in the Regional Regulation Plan (RAPENDA)

Currently, the Special Committee for PT. Pelabuhan Kepri has evaluated the management policy of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri asks the Kepri Province Government to immediately prepare the operational equipment such as management, offices, addresses, and other supporting facilities. In addition, the Kepri Province Government might soon establish a Board of Commissioners of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri to follow up and form the Directors and organs of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri if necessary. Then, the Special Committee stated PT. Pelabuhan Kepri asked the Board of Commissioners of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri to immediately establish the Directors of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri, by forming a Selection Committee (PANSEL) and conducting a Fit and Profers Test through the House of Representatives in Kepri Provincial (DPRD).

Furthermore, PT. Pelabuhan Kepri can run as intended also can make a real contribution to the Regional Original Revenue of Kepri Province. The Board of Commissioners and Director's appointment must be filled by professional people, who have an entrepreneurial spirit, are honest, responsible, and have high dedication to advance PT. Pelabuhan Kepri. Then, PT. Pelabuhan Kepri must also prepare transparent financial reports every year, which an independent audit has audited. So, the report is submitted to the Governor as Commissioner and the Kepri Province DPRD to carry out the supervisory function. In the appointment of the company as a cooperation partner of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri is to prioritize the companies domiciled in the Kepri region. The role of DPRD is to provide information as early as possible as part of an early warning system for local governments. Supervision will provide feedback to improve the management of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri won't get out of the path/stages and goals set so that the management activities can achieve goals and objectives effectively and efficiently.

4. Conslucion

PT. Pelabuhan Kepri has enormous potential that must be developed in managing local revenue sources in the waters sector of the Kepri Province because it has a strategic area with state borders. The existence of policy evaluation in management and preparation in planning optimizing the quality of human resources requires support from all stakeholder actors, from local government, central government, private parties, and the community. The performance of PT. Pelabuhan Kepri can be measured better if the support facilities in implementing the realized program suitable to what has been planned. Kepri Province Government has an important role in BUMD needs which is having a great potential to obtain local revenue sources through PT Pelabuhan Kepri. So, the capital that must be given by the Kepri Province Government to PT. Pelabuhan Kepri must be prioritized for the achievement of programs that have a direct impact on the welfare of the community.

Acknowledgements

Acknowledgments I say as the first author to my thesis supervisor, namely the second and third authors who are willing to provide input and criticism so that this article has been published in the Journal of Public Policy and Administration in the December 2021 edition as a requirement for the final thesis on the master's degree in public administration, Universitas Maritim Raja Ali Haji, Tanjung Pinang, Kepulauan Riau, Indonesia. I also do not forget to thank the reviewers and administrators of the Public Policy Journal and the administration who are willing to publish my articles properly. And lastly, especially my family and my beloved husband, who always give full support.

References

- [1] Mahadiansar, M., Ikhsan, K., Sentanu, I. G. E. P. S., & Asparyana, A. (2020). Paradigma pengembangan model pembangunan nasional Di Indonesia. *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi: Media Pengembangan Ilmu dan Praktek Administrasi*, 17 (1), 77–92. <https://doi.org/10.31113/jia.v17i1.550>.
- [2] Ateh, M. Y. (2014). Review literatur pengelolaan Badan Usaha Milik Daerah. *Badan Pengawasan Keuangan dan Pembangunan Pusat Penelitian dan Pengembangan Pengawasan*. Retrieved July 24, 2021, from <http://www.bpkp.go.id/puslitbangwas/konten/2291/14.125-Review-Literatur-Pengelolaan-Badan-Usaha-Milik-Daerah>.
- [3] Muryanto, Y. T., & Djuwityastuti, D. (2014). Model pengelolaan Badan Usaha Milik Daerah (BUMD) dalam rangka mewujudkan good corporate governance. *Yustisia Jurnal Hukum*, 3 (1), 125–134. <https://doi.org/10.20961/YUSTISIA.V3I1.10136>.
- [4] Suhendra, A., & Taufiq, M. (2018). Asas fiduciary skill and care dalam pengelolaan BUMD guna mewujudkan good corporate governance. *Jurnal Ilmiah Living Law*, 10 (2), 139–154. <https://doi.org/10.30997/JILL.V10I2.1499>.
- [5] Siahaan, H., Priyarsono, D., Rifin, A., & Arifin, B. (2021). Factors affecting performance and growth of food sector BUMD Jakarta Province. *BISNIS & BIROKRASI: Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi dan Organisasi*, 28 (1), 3. <https://doi.org/10.20476/jbb.v28i1.1250>.
- [6] Taufiq, M. (2018). Kedudukan hukum corporate social responsibility pada BUMD berdasar Undang-Undang RI Nomor 40 Tahun 2007. *Proceedings Progress Conference*, 1 (1), 606–613.
- [7] Yansyah, A. B., Muhammad, A. S., & Prastya, I. Y. (2021). Proses pembentukan BUMDesa bersama kandiil bahar dengan pendekatan collaborative governance di Kecamatan Tambelan. *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Perbatasan dan Desa*, 1 (1), 128–136. Retrieved from <https://ojs.umrah.ac.id/index.php/snppd/article/view/3323>.
- [8] Yani, T. A., & Mansur, T. M. (2020). Mewujudkan keharmonisan undang-undang perseroan terbatas dalam pendirian perseroan daerah. *Kanun Jurnal Ilmu Hukum*, 22 (2), 363–378. <https://doi.org/10.24815/KANUN.V22I2.16184>.
- [9] Irvan, T. (2018). Kajian yuridis pembentukan Badan Usaha Pelabuhan Pemerintah Provinsi Kepulauan Riau. *Journal of Law and Policy Transformation*, 3 (1), 199–212. Retrieved from <https://journal.uib.ac.id/index.php/jlpt/article/view/305>.
- [10] Erwinsyahbana, T. (2017). Pertanggungjawaban yuridis direksi terhadap risiko kerugian keuangan daerah pada Badan Usaha Milik Daerah. *DE LEGA LATA: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum*, 2 (1), 183–212. Retrieved from <http://journal.umsu.ac.id/index.php/delegalata/article/view/1145>.
- [11] Heriasman, H., & Suwaji, S. (2021). Efektifitas dan kontribusi laba Badan Usaha Milik Daerah (BUMD) terhadap pendapatan asli daerah (PAD) Kabupaten Indragiri Hulu. *SULTANIST: Jurnal Manajemen dan Keuangan*, 9 (1), 60–68. <https://doi.org/10.37403/SULTANIST.V9I1.245>.
- [12] Krisharyanto, E., Setyowati, P. J., & Wulandari, S. (2021). Code of Ethics as an Instrument in Improving the Performance of the BUMD Supervisory Board. *SSRN Electronic Journal*. <https://doi.org/10.2139/SSRN.3806516>.
- [13] Budhisulistiyawati, A., Muryanto, Y. T., & Sri, A. (2015). Strategi pengelolaan Badan usaha Milik Daerah (BUMD) Persero untuk mewujudkan prinsip tata kelola perusahaan yang baik. *Private Law*, 3 (2), 56–66. Retrieved from <https://www.neliti.com/publications/164361/strategi-pengelolaan-badan-usaha-milik-daerah-bumd-persero-untuk-mewujudkan-prin>.
- [14] Anderson, J. (1994). *Public policymaking*. Houghton Mifflin.
- [15] Nachmias, D. (1980). The role of evaluation in public policy. *Policy Studies Journal*, 1163–1169.
- [16] Wibawa, S. (1994). *Evaluasi kebijakan publik*. Depok: PT Raja Grafindo Persada.
- [17] Stufflebeam, D. L., & Webster, W. J. (1980). An analysis of alternative approach to evaluation. *Education Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 2 (3), 5–20.
- [18] Pierson, B. P. (1993). When effect becomes cause: policy feedback and political change. *World Politics*, 45 (04), 595–628.

- [19] Poti, J., & Mahadiansar, M. (2020). Evaluasi kebijakan revitalisasi pasar tradisional: Studi pasar akau potong lembu kota tanjungpinang. *Kolaborasi: Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 6 (3), 294–309. <https://doi.org/10.26618/kjap.v6i3.4165>.
- [20] Lofland, John., & Lofland, L. H. (1995). *Analyzing social settings: A guide to qualitative observation and analysis*. Wadsworth.
- [21] Moleong, L. J. (2012). *Metodologi penelitian kualitatif*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- [22] Galvan, J. L., & Galvan, M. C. (2017). *Writing literatur reviews: A guide for student of the social and behavior sciences (7th ed.)*. California: Routledge.
- [23] Zed, M. (2014). *Metode penelitian kepustakaan (3rd ed.)*. Jakarta: Yayasan Obor Indonesia.
- [24] Denzin, N., & Lincoln, Y. (2005). *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research (Third Edition.)*. SAGE.
- [25] Hurteau, M., Houle, S., & Mongiat, S. (2009). How Legimate and justified are judgement in program evaluation? *Evaluation*, 15 (3), 307–319.
- [26] Gallagher, S. (2019). *Banking performance and socio economic development*. India: Scientific e-Resources.
- [27] Rossi, P. H., W. Lipsey, M., Lipsey, M. W., & Freeman, H. E. (2004). *Evaluation: A systematic approach*. New York: SAGE Publications.
- [28] House, E. R. (1978). Assumptions Underlying Evaluation Models. *Educational Researcher*, 7 (3), 4–12.
- [29] Grahl, J., & Teague, P. (2004). The German model in danger. *Industrial Relations Journal*, 35 (6).
- [30] Gardner, H. (2003). Multiple intelligences after twenty years. *Education*, 21 (617), 1–15.
- [31] Elliott, S. (2012). Public relations defined, after an energetic public discussion. *The New York Time*. Retrieved February 27, 2020, from <https://www.nytimes.com/2012/03/02/business/media/public-relations-a-topic-that-is-tricky-to-define.html>.
- [32] Gall, M. D., Gall, J. P., & Borg, W. R. (2003). *Educational research: an introduction*. United States America: Allyn and Bacon.
- [33] Bourgeois, D. T. (2014). *What is an information system? Information Systems for Business and Beyond*. Washington DC.
- [34] Roznovsky, N. A. (2015). *What is management information systems? Mays Business School Texas A & M University*. Retrieved February 27, 2020, from <http://mays.tamu.edu/info/what-is-mis/>.
- [35] Cornwell, M. A. (2017). *Management information systems (MIS) degree*. Saunders College of Business. Retrieved February 27, 2020, from <https://saunders.rit.edu/undergraduate/majors-minors/management-information-systems-mis-degree-overview>.
- [36] Myers, G. (1997). *People & Change Planning for Action*. Oriell Corporation.
- [37] Dykstra, C. A. (1939). The quest for responsibility. *American Political Science Review*, 33 (1), 1012–1013.
- [38] Williams, C. (2006). Introduction. In *Leadership Accountability in a Globalizing World* (pp. 1–4). London: Palgrave Macmillan UK.
- [39] Alqahtani, K. (2016). Decision oriented evaluation: A review of various models of evaluation. *International Journal of Scientific & Engineering Research*, 7 (5), 929–931.
- [40] Ascher, W. (1986). The evolution of the policy sciences: Understanding the rise and avoiding the fall. *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 5 (2), 365.
- [41] Sabatier, P. A. (1991). Toward better theories of the policy process: Political science and public policy. *PS: Political Science and Politics*, 24 (2), 144–147.
- [42] Fitzpatrick, D., Scanlon, E., Krüse, J., Vos, B., Evans-Hurson, R., Fitzpatrick, E., & McSweeney, S. (2012). Blend uniformity analysis of pharmaceutical products by Broadband Acoustic Resonance Dissolution Spectroscopy (BARDS). *International Journal of Pharmaceutics*, 438 (1–2), 134–139.